What do Evaluators look for in a Smart City Proposal?
(Based on parameters used for scoring)

Q.1   **In the last three years, what efforts have been made by the city to improve livability, sustainability and economic development? Give specific examples along with improvement with KPIs that are in the public domain and/ or can be validated. Your answer should cover, but not be restricted to {Describe in max. 50 words each, mentioning the source of the data}:**

   a) **Transportation condition in the city**
   b) **Water availability in the city and reduction in water wastage/ NRW**
   c) **Solid waste management programs in the city**
   d) **Safety/ security conditions in the city**
   e) **Energy availability and reduction of outages in the city**
   f) **Housing situation in the city, specifically role of municipality in expediting building plan approvals, property tax collection, etc.**

   - The answer should capture improvement of operational efficiency in last three years in the city in above areas.
   - The inference should be based on reliable data.

Q.2   **In the last three years, what have been the changes in Administrative Efficiency due to the use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) {Describe in max. 50 words each, mentioning the source of the data}:**
   a) **Overall attendance of functionaries**
   b) **Two-way communication between citizens and administration**
   c) **Use of e-Gov to enable hassle free access to statutory documents**
   d) **Dashboards that integrate analytics and visualization of data **
   e) **Availability of basic information relevant to citizens.**

   - The answer should capture Improvement in Administrative Efficiency due to use of Information technology in last three years depicting the trend.
   - The inference should be based on reliable data.

Q.3   **Based on the detailed city profiling, what are the strengths and developmental areas of the city? Conduct a detailed SWOT analysis of the city with all relevant metrics and data.**

   - Cities should identify strengths and opportunities based on city profiling and citizen consultations.
   - The strengths identified should be closely connected to citizen responses and analysis of city profiling.

Q.4 **Based on the SWOT analysis, what should be the strategic focus of the city and the strategic blueprint for its development over next 5-10 years to make it more livable and sustainable?**

- The strategy should come out of the SWOT analysis. There should be greater connect between the SWOT and the strategy for cities.
- The strategy should result in a decent quality of life for all citizens, a clean and sustainable environment and enhanced capacity to make continuous improvements in the city over time.

Q.5 **What should be the vision of the city based on the strategic blueprint? How does the Vision Statement relate specifically to the city's profile and the unique challenges and opportunities present in your city? Define overall aspirations and goals for the city along with how you see key metrics of livability and sustainability improving over the next 5-10 years?**

- The vision should be aligned to the economic, cultural/social strengths of the city.
- The vision should look at the large picture – role to be played by the city in the future and the future image of the city envisaged in the vision.
- The goals should be aligned with the vision and the strategy describes the pathway for the full city to become smart over time.

Q.6 **How has city leveraged citizen engagement as a tool to define its vision and goals? Specifically describe (max 150 words each):**

   a) **Extent of citizens involved in shaping vision and goals**
   b) **Engagement strategy to get best results from citizens**
   c) **Different means of citizen engagement adopted**
   d) **Extent of coverage of citizen engagement in different media and channels**
   e) **Incorporation of citizen inputs in overall vision**

- The vision should include the peoples' aspirations and which the goals should be based on vision derived from SWOT, as well as citizen consultations
- The citizen engagement should use smart' processes and consultation with women, weaker sections, differently-abled, youth, children, etc.

Q.7 **Define the baseline for your city based on self-assessment criteria given in Annexure 2 (column 'H'). Marks will be awarded based on how well you know your city. (Fill column 'I' in the self-assessment sheet in Annexure 2 with as many KPIs and "hard metrics" as possible.**

- The quality of KPI is connected to the aspiration of citizen. Indicators should be specific to measure assessment criteria in the self-assessment sheet.
- The indicators should be based on reliable data.

Q.8 **Emerging from the vision statement, assess the qualitative or quantifiable outcomes that need to be achieved for each of the Smart City Features described in Annexure 2 (column 'J'). In column 'K' describe the biggest single initiative/solution that would get each feature of the city to achieve 'advanced' characteristics (eg. increasing share of renewable energy generation in the city by X percent). Note that a single initiative/solution may impact a number of features (eg. improved management of public spaces may ease congestion on roads as well as improve public health).**
(Fill in Annexure 2)

- The vision statement should be related to outcomes and there should be a closer connect between the vision and outcomes.

- The proposal should provide a stronger rationale for prioritization based on credible data.

Q.9 **Summarize your idea for an area-based development (ABD).**

- The proposal should display a clear understanding of the development in all its dimensions/aspects. Smart Features may be included in the proposal as are contextually relevant .The proposals should creatively respond to the context.

- The proposal should be replicable / scalable to the full city so that the entire city develops over a period of time.

- Government order, laws, rules, etc support the claims.

Q.10 **What is the approach and methodology followed in selecting/identifying the area-based development? Describe the reasons for your choice based on the following (max. 1000 words):**
    a) **The city profile**
    b) **Citizen opinion and engagement**
    c) **Opinion of the elected representatives**
    d) **Discussion with urban planners and sector experts**
    e) **Discussion with suppliers/ partners**

- Citizen responses should be incorporated in the selection of area-based development.
- Consultation should be done with diverse groups and should include accessibility features for disabled.
- The prioritization of area should be based on a strong rationale.

Q.11 **List the key components of your area-based development proposal (eg. buildings, landscaping, on-site infrastructure, water recycling, dual piping for water supply, etc.)?**

- All the Essential features given in Mission Guidelines should be included.

- Essential Features proposed should bring about a clear improvement and are innovatively applied/realized

- Smart Solutions to be applied to make services and infrastructure better in the

ABD.

Q.12 **Describe the 'smart' characteristics of the proposed development that relate to urban form (eg. uncluttered public places, mixed-use, open spaces, walk-ability) and how these will be incorporated.**

- The proposal needs to look at: doing more with less, building upon existing infrastructural assets and resources, being resource efficient.
- Government order, laws, rules, etc should support claims.

Q.13 **In Table 1, list the Missions/Programmes/Schemes of the Government of India (eg. AMRUT, HRIDAY, SBM, IPDS, Shelter for All, Digital India, Make in India, Skill India) and relevant external projects and describe how your proposal will achieve convergence with these, in terms of human and financial resources, common activities and goals.**

- The proposal should intend to dovetail different sources of funding (e.g. Central Government, ULB/State, other complementary Central and State funds) leading to four types of infrastructure- Physical, Social, Economic and Institutional.
- The convergence proposed needs to be aligned to the priorities set in the National Agenda (e.g. SBM, Make in India Skill India, etc.)

Q.14 **Describe how the convergence will be implemented?**

- The proposal should list out the readiness and action taken to implement convergence –describing actions taken for creating consistent and predictable mechanisms to achieve convergence (eg. government order issued, council resolutions passed, delegation made, etc.)
- Claims should be supported by government order, laws, rules, etc

Q.15 **What are the three greatest risks that could prevent the success of the area-based proposal? In Table 2, describe each risk, its likelihood, the likely impact and the mitigation you propose.**

- The buy-in of the State Government and other organizations (eg. Electricity Company) will make the proposal more do-able.
- Cities should identify risks between input/activity and activity/output.
- Cities should suggest risk mitigation that has a greater chance to achieve the results.

Q.16 **In Table 3, describe a plan for achieving the essential features in your area-based proposal by listing the inputs (monetary, physical and human resources) that will be required for the activities that you will conduct, the outputs (immediate effects) and outcomes (medium-term results) of these activities.**

- The do-ability of the proposal within the set timelines and funds.
- the chosen implementation framework should be appropriate for the nature and type of area-based developments being envisaged
- The assumptions made in proposals needs to be realistic in moving

progressively from inputs/activities, to activities/outputs to outputs/outcomes.

- Claims should be supported by government order, laws, rules, etc

Q.17 Describe the three most significant factors for ensuring the success of the area-based development proposal. What will your city do if these factors turn out to be different from what you have assumed?

- Significance of the success factors should be identified and appropriateness to the nature of the ABD.
- Back-up plans that are more likely to achieve the intended results must be developed.

Q.18 What will be the measurable impact of the area-based development proposal, on the area and the wider city, through scale-up and replication? Please describe with respect to the five types below, as relevant to your city and proposals (max. 150 words each):
   a) Governance Impact
   b) Spatial Impact
   c) Economic Impact
   d) Social Impact (eg. accessible features included in the Proposal)
   e) Sustainability, including environmental impact

- Proposals should have higher governance, spatial, economic social and environmental impact.

Q.19 Summarize your idea for a pan-city proposal.

- Identification of ICT-based solution which can improve governance and/or delivery of public services
- Rationale should be strong in selecting the Pan city Smart Solution.
- Claims should be supported by government order, laws, rules, et

Q.20 List the key components of your pan-city proposal?

- Proposal should demonstrate a better understanding of ICT-based solutions and it should help in improving quality of life.

Q.21 What is the approach and methodology followed in selecting/identifying the pan-city proposal? Describe the reasons for your choice based on the following:
   a) The city profile and self assessment
   b) Citizen opinion and engagement
   c) Opinion of the elected representatives
   d) Discussion with urban planners and sector experts
   e) **Discussion with suppliers/ partners**

- Consultations should be held with diverse groups.
- Inclusion of the sub-components in Smart Solutions that make governance and public services accessible for the differently-abled should be considered.
- The smart solution should be derived from citizen engagement – crowd-

sourced solution supported by large number of citizens.

- 'Smart' processes should be used during consultations.

Q.22   What are the specific issues related to governance and public services that you have identified during city profiling and citizen engagement that you would like to address through your pan city proposal? How do you think these solution(s) would solve the specific issues and goals you have identified?

- There should be a closer link between identified issues/priorities from consultations/profiling and the solution selected.
- There should be a close correspondence between the input/resources and the intended results and established appropriateness in selection of Smart Solutions.

Q.23   How inclusive is your pan-city proposal? What makes it so?

- Consultation should include viewpoint of women, weaker sections, differently-abled, youth, children, etc

Q.24   What are the three greatest risks that could prevent the success of the pan-city proposal? In table 3, describe each risk, its likelihood, the likely impact and the mitigation you propose.

- The buy-in of the State Government and other organizations with credible evidence of support (eg. Electricity Company for smart meters, parastatal for SCADA) will make the proposal more do-able.

Q.25   Which is the model or 'best practice' from your own or another city that you are adopting or adapting in your proposal? How are you innovating and ensuring best use of resources? Is there an aspect of 'frugal innovation' in your proposal?

- Proposal should indicate how the Smart Solution(s) proposed is an improvement on a previously attempted initiative.
- Should have frugal innovation embedded in the solution.

Q.26   In Table 4, list the Missions/Programmes/Schemes of the Government of India (eg. SBM, AMRUT, HRIDAY, Shelter for All, Digital India, Make in India, Skill India) and relevant external projects and describe how your proposal will achieve convergence with these, in terms of human and financial resources, common activities and goals.

- The proposal should intend to dovetail different sources of funding (e.g. Central Government, ULB/State, other complementary Central and State funds).
- Convergence should be aligned to the priorities set in the National Agenda (e.g. SBM, Make in India Skill India, etc.)

Q.27   Describe how the convergence will be implemented.

- The proposal should list out the readiness and action taken to implement

convergence –describing actions taken for creating consistent and predictable mechanisms to achieve convergence (eg. government order issued, council resolutions passed, delegation made, etc.)

Q.28   Describe the three most significant factors for ensuring the success of the pan-city proposal. What will your city do if these factors turn out to be different from what you have assumed?

- Most significant factors are identified and the alternative models which can achieve results may be explored

Q.29   How will you measure the success of your pan-city proposal and when will the public be able to 'see' or 'feel' benefits: immediately, within Year 1, or in the medium or long term, 3-5 years?

- Accurate assessment of immediate, short-, medium- and long-term impacts should be done.
- Proposals should have an immediate and sustainable impact

Q.30   What will be the measurable impact of your pan-city proposal? Please describe with respect to the following types given below, as relevant to your city and proposals:
   a) Governance Impact (eg. government response time to citizen complaints halved, creating faster service delivery overall)
   b) Impact on public services (eg. real-time monitoring of mosquito density in the atmosphere reduces morbidity)

- Proposal is expected to have greater impact on delivery of public services and governance.

Q.31   In Table 5, describe the activities/components, targets, resources and timelines required to complete the implementation of your area-based development and pan-city solution/s.

- Proposals should contain outputs which are achievable keeping in consideration the resources, activities and targeted outputs.
- There should be clear identification of resources and activities in order to achieve results.
- Claims should be supported by government order, laws, rules, etc

Q.32   Using information from Table 5, describe the critical milestones, realistic timelines and sequencing of efforts and events that you are projecting as the short-, medium- and long-term scenarios for your smart city. If necessary, include PERT and CPM charts in Annexure 3.

- It should depict logical sequence of activities in the process of implementation
- The extent of inter-linkages between area-based proposal and pan-city solution should be captured.

Q.33   **The SPV is a critical institution for the implementation of the Proposal. Describe the SPV you propose to create in your city, with details of its composition and structure, leadership and governance, and holding pattern. Based on your responses in Table 6 describe how you envision the SPV to fulfill the role set out in the Mission Guidelines.**

- There should be evidence of buy-in from the State/Council to create the SPV.
- ULBs should propose creation of a legal mechanism/contractual framework agreed by the State Government.
- ULBs should propose creation of a robust mechanism for collaboration between the planning authorities, water boards, etc.

Q.34   **In Table 7, give details of the government (Central, state/ULB) departments, parastatal organizations and public agencies who will be involved with the time-bound execution of each of the project activities/components (both area-based and pan-city) you have identified. (In Annexure 3, include a flowchart showing the network/relationships that the SPV will form with government and non-government agencies, and indicating the nature of connection with each entity.)**

- There should be clarity in identification of organization capacities and domain jurisdiction and creating a mechanism for cooperation among different parties.
- There should be clarity in understanding of decision-flow and nature of connections between different parties.
- Claims should be supported by government order, laws, rules, et

Q.35   **In Table 8, give details of all the private companies, corporations and organizations that need to be engaged with the execution and operations & maintenance of the various activities and components envisaged in this proposal, along with a description of their roles and responsibilities as basic TORs. Use appropriate terms such as 'vendor', 'concessionaire', 'JV partner', etc.**

- Extent of external partners participating in execution and O&M should be captured in the proposal.
- There should be clarity in the agreement between the SPV and external partners
- Proposals should also highlight Innovation in bundling of O&M services for effective PPP arrangements.

Q.36   **Create an organogram that shows the relationships between all those who helped you create this proposal and the role they will play in the future, such as:**
a) MPs, MLAs, MLCs.
b) Mayors, Councilors, other elected representatives.
c) Divisional Commissioner
d) Collector
e) Municipal Commissioner

- Proposals should highlight the extent of stakeholders' contribution and continuity and ownership during implementation of the SCP.

Q.37 **What is the total project cost of your Smart City Proposal (SCP)? Describe in detail the costs for each of the activities/components identified in Questions 31.**

- There should be a close link between the question no. 31 and in turn to question 16
- Proposals should show extent to which all Essential Features have been included in the total project cost with proposals containing all Essential Features.
- Proposals should establish the feasibility of implementation of the Essential Features (eg. water supply available from off-site sources/recycling/water harvesting to provide adequate water supply to the Area)
- Government order, laws, rules, etc should support claims.

Q.38 **Describe the financing sources, the own-sources of income, the financial schemes of the Central or State governments for which your city/SPV is eligible, which can be used to fund the SCP proposals and pay back loans. Briefly describe an action-plan for resource improvement to make the ULB financially self-sustaining.**

- The proposal should creatively manage different sources of funding and financing to ensure settlement of debt.
- Use of resources suggested in proposal should create value.
- Convergence options as source of funding should be well laid out in the proposal.
- The 'action plan' for resource improvement should be convincing and feasible.
- Financial sustainability of the proposal should be well established.

Q.39 **What is the lifetime cost estimated for your area-based development and your pan-city solution/s? Add O&M costs wherever applicable. Briefly describe an action-plan for resource improvement to make the ULB financially self-sustaining.**

- Proposal should demonstrate revenue-generating potential of the proposal to payback the capital cost and provide for O&M expenses.
- Claims should be supported by government order, laws, rules, etc.

Q.40 **How will the area based development and the pan-city smart solutions(s) of your city be financed? If you plan to seek loans or issue bonds, what revenue sources will be used to pay back the loans?**

- Extent to which the proposal intends to tap the financial market, monetize land, etc. – proposal showing credible effort towards feasibility should be highlighted.
- Proposal should include innovative financing and taps external sources of funding.
- State Government buy-in and transfers funds from the additional FFC receipts, SFC recommendations, etc –should be supported by government

order, laws, rules, etc

Q.41 **What is your plan for covering the Operations & Maintenance costs for each of the activities/components identified in Questions 31?**

- Provision for revenue generation, to provide for O&M expenses, should be made in the proposal - supported by government order, laws, rules, etc.
- Proposal should list out ways to catalyze the generation of additional revenue to sustain the city's long-term agenda to become fully 'smart'.

Q.42 **What is the financial timeline for your smart city agenda? Describe the milestones and target dates related to fund flows, payback commitments, etc. that must be adhered to for the proposal to achieve the vision set out in Table 6 (question 31)?**

- Proposal should indicate the extent to which results are achievable within set timelines keeping in consideration the fund flows, etc
- Proposal should also highlight how the city vision will be achieved and the complete city made 'smart' keeping in view the payback commitments.

Q. 43 **What is your plan for mitigating financial risk? Do you have any alternatives or fall-back plans if the financial assumptions do not hold?**

- Proposal should contain Do-ability aspects, considering the risks that have been identified.
- The proposal should also establish extent to which the fallback plan appears to be reliable.